



**HUMAN RIGHTS AND  
EQUALITY INSTITUTION  
OF TÜRKİYE**

# **THE REPORT ON THE VISIT TO KAHRAMANMARAŞ TEMPORARY ACCOMMODATION CENTER**

**Report No:**  
*2022/32*

Accepted unanimously as per the Human Rights and Equality Board of Türkiye's resolution no 2022/523 of 09.08.2022

## Table of Contents

|   |    |
|---|----|
| 1. INTRODUCTION.....  | 1  |
| 2. GENERAL INFORMATION .....  | 2  |
| 2.1. Information on the Center .....  | 2  |
| 2.2. Information on those under protection at the Center.....                                       | 3  |
| 3. FINDINGS, OBSERVATIONS AND INTERVIEWS.....   | 3  |
| 3.1 Prevention of Torture and Ill-Treatment and Complaint Procedures.....                           | 3  |
| 3.2. Material Conditions.....   | 4  |
| 3.3. Healthcare Services .....  | 7  |
| 3.4. Psychosocial Support Services.....   | 9  |
| 3.5. Social Benefits.....   | 11 |
| 3.6. Education.....   | 11 |
| 3.7. Activities and Courses.....  | 12 |
| 3.8. Contact with the Outside World, Visiting and Interaction with Families .....                   | 14 |
| 3.9. Vulnerable Groups .....  | 15 |
| 3.10. Personnel .....   | 16 |
| 4. EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....  | 17 |
| 4.1. EVALUATION .....   | 17 |
| 4.2. RECOMMENDATIONS .....  | 18 |
| 4.2.1. Recommendations to the Center .....  | 18 |
| 4.2.2. Recommendations to Presidency of Migration Management .....                                  | 19 |
| 4.2.3. Recommendation to the Ministry of National Education <b>Hata! Yer işareti tanımlanmamış.</b> |    |
| 4.2.4. Recommendation to the Ministry of Health..... <b>Hata! Yer işareti tanımlanmamış.</b>        |    |

## **ABBREVIATIONS**

**UN** : United Nations

**Covid-19** : New Corona Virus Disease

**EBA** : Education Information Network

**OPCAT** : Optional Protocol to the United Nations Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment

**PİCTES** : Project on Promoting Integration of Syrian Kids into the Turkish Education System

**HREIT** : Human Rights and Equality Institution of Türkiye

**NPM** : National Preventive Mechanism

## 1. INTRODUCTION

1. The Human Rights and Equality Institution of Türkiye (HREIT) was established by Law No. 6701 to protect and promote human rights on the basis of human dignity, to guarantee the right of individuals to be treated equally, to prevent discrimination in the enjoyment of legally recognized rights and freedoms, to operate in line with these principles and to effectively combat torture and ill-treatment.
2. Türkiye signed the Optional Protocol to the United Nations (UN) Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (OPCAT) on 14.09.2005. The objective of OPCAT, which took effect following its approval in 2011 and became binding on Türkiye, is: "to establish a system in which independent international and national bodies pay regular visits to places where people are deprived of their liberty in order to prevent torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment."<sup>1</sup>
3. As per subparagraph 9/1-1 of Law no.6701, acting as a National Preventive Mechanism (NPM) is included in the duties of the Institution pursuant to the provisions of OPCAT. As per subparagraph 2/1-k of the Law, NPM refers to *"the system established to make regular visits to places where persons are deprived of their liberty pursuant to the Optional Protocol to the UN Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment"*. In this framework, subparagraph (j) of the same article states that the Institution has the duty and authority to carry out regular visits, with or without notice, to the places where persons deprived of their liberty or placed under protection are located.
4. The Government of the Republic of Türkiye has taken a humanitarian decision towards the Syrian citizens who have massively and intensively sought refuge in our country due to the civil war and humanitarian tragedies in Syria and has accepted Syrian citizens to our country within the scope of the open door policy it follows. Today, more than 3.5 million of these people have been granted "temporary protection status" and taken under protection.
5. The legal status, material standards and principles regarding the operation of temporary Accomodation centers in Türkiye are determined by the "Temporary Protection Regulation" published in the Official Gazette dated 22.10.2014 and numbered 29153 and the "Directive on the Establishment, Management and Operation of Temporary Accomodation Centers" issued on the basis thereof.

---

<sup>1</sup> OPCAT, art. 1.

6. Visits to temporary Accomodation centers fall within the mandate and duty of HREIT. As part of the performance of this duty, an unannounced visit was conducted to Kahramanmaraş Temporary Accomodation Center on 28.07.2021 by the decison taken at the meeting of the Human Rights and Equality Board of Türkiye dated 09.02.2021 and numbered 147 and Presidential Decree dated 16.07.2021, in the context of national and international norms.
7. The delegation established for the visit included Human Rights and Equality Expert Nesrin ÖZTÜRK, Human Rights and Equality Assistant Experts Hayriye KORKMAZ, Furkan GENÇ, and Social Service Expert Şeyma GÜNDÜR. Additionally, a doctor and a psychologist requested from the Governorate of Kahramanmaraş were also included in the delegation.
8. The visit started with the first meeting with the Center Administrators, during which information about the Center was obtained. After the first meeting, the visiting delegation visited the warehouse building where various products for the Center are stored, the health center, the market, the schools, the sports fields, the public education center and the cafeteria; interviews were conducted with people encountered and staff working in the common areas visited. The visiting delegation was then divided into two groups and visited the neighborhoods where the persons under protection at the Center live and conducted interviews with persons under temporary protection living in container houses, toured the containers and noted their positive and negative evaluations of the Center. The visit was concluded with a final meeting with the Center Administration and initial findings and observations were submitted to the Administration.
9. This report contains an evaluation of the findings, observations and interviews obtained resulting from HREIT's monitoring visit to Kahramanmaraş Temporary Accomodation Center in the context of national and international norms.<sup>2</sup>

## **2. GENERAL INFORMATION**

### **2.1. Information on the Center**

10. The center is built on 374,328,566 square meters of land. Although the center had a capacity of 5,008 containers, 7 neighborhoods, and 25,000 people, reducing crowding works were carried out in 2018 and 2019, and 2,308 containers were dismantled under the Disaster and Emergency Management Presidency in 2020 and 2021. At the time of the visit, there were

---

<sup>2</sup> Hereinafter referred to as the Center.



the Center and management. No allegations of torture, ill-treatment, degrading punishment or treatment were made at the Center. No evidence of torture or ill-treatment was found during the visit.

15. The administration stated that no staff member had been subjected to any proceedings for torture and ill-treatment in the last year.
16. Persons under protection at the Center submit their complaints and requests directly, through interpreters or headmen of their neighborhood, usually verbally, to the Administration of the Center. There are request and complaint boxes at the center. However, it has been learned that these complaint boxes are not very preferred. There is also an Alo 157 Foreigners Communication Center (YİMER) hotline under the supervision of the Directorate of Migration Management. Judicial complaints are made directly to the Gendarmerie Station Command or the Public Prosecutor's Office within the Center campus. It is learned that the complaints and requests at the Center are mostly about the change of fixtures and fittings (such as refrigerators, electric cookers), change of containers or neighborly relations.
17. According to the data shared by the administration; there were 212 judicial cases in 2018, 86 in 2019, 91 in 2020 and 44 in 2021 (until 01.07.2021). It was shared that most of the judicial cases were deliberately injuring cases, and in this context, 83 cases of deliberately injuring occurred in 2018, 19 cases in 2019, 5 cases in 2020, and 3 cases of deliberately injuring until July 2021. It can be inferred from these data that acts of violence as judicial cases have decreased in the Center over the years.

### **3.2. Material Conditions**

18. There are 1 public education center, 4 schools, 7 administration buildings, 1 visitor building, 3 mosques, 1 market, 4 warehouses, 1 condolence house, 1 conference hall, 2 health center buildings, 1 meeting hall, 1 Qur'an course, 1 staff cafeteria, 1 technology training center, 1 child-friendly area, 8 children's playgrounds, 8 sports fields as the common spaces in the center. Additionally, the Center has 1 water reservoir, 1 wastewater package treatment plant, and 18 security towers.
19. 2,399 of the 2,700 containers in the center are actively used. The containers are two-story and each container has an area of 7x3=21 square meters. Containers accommodate 5 people on average. It was also observed that the balconies were covered with blankets or tent cloths both to expand the covered area and to protect from the heat. However, considering that the containers are overheated due to the materials used in the construction of the containers, it

is thought that these items used on the balconies to protect from the heat may cause a fire. Indeed, it was previously reported by the Central Administration that a fire broke out due to the above-mentioned issue and that the pieces of cloth covered on the containers were burnt. Even though it was stated by the administration that necessary warnings were given to the people staying in the containers, it was observed that these warnings were not complied with during the visit.



20. The number of people staying in containers designed for 5 people varies according to the size of the families. In cases where the number of people in the family increases to 8 or there is a person over the age of 17 in a family of 7 people, they are placed in a new container.
21. In the center, each container is provided with a bed per person, 1 stove, 1 heater, 1 refrigerator, covering material and kitchen tools such as pots and pans. There is also a washing machine in each container. It was stated by the administration and the people living in the container that there were no problems with basic household items, and that those under temporary protection applied to the technical service for broken items and that these items were repaired as soon as possible, or replaced if repair was not possible. It has been observed that there are electric fans in the containers of the families whose financial situation is sufficient, and at the entrance of some containers, there are handmade fans made by the people staying there in order to cool the air inside. It has been observed that the handmade fans are insufficient to cool the containers. In the interview with persons under temporary protection in one of the containers, it was found out that the container was overheated, causing them to feel suffocated and that this was the only complaint they had about the Center.
22. Electricity and water are provided in containers on a quota basis. Both the Administration and the people living in the containers said that the water and electricity provided were sufficient. It has been observed that there is no problem in the center in terms of supplying water and electricity, as the most basic needs. It was stated that when the quota is exceeded, electricity and water are provided again so as not to cause any inconvenience to the families.
23. It is stated that heating in the containers is provided by electric stoves during the winter. It was stated by the persons under temporary protection that the containers are small and therefore they heat up quickly and there are no problems with heating in winter.
24. The cleaning of the Center is the duty of both the personnel and the persons under protection at the Center. The personnel cleans the main arteries of the Center, while the people living in the containers clean in front of their own houses. Garbage is collected daily by the Municipality. During the visit, it was observed that the common areas of the Center were clean and the fronts of the containers were swept and washed by the people staying in the containers. No stench or piles of rubbish that could be harmful to children and stray animals were found in the center.

### 3.3. Healthcare Services

25. The healthcare services in the Center are carried out by the Empowered Migrant Health Center established with the support of the Kahramanmaraş Provincial Directorate of Health. It is stated that the Health Center provides services on a 24/7 basis. In addition, it is stated that polyclinic services are provided between 08:00 and 17:00 on 5 weekdays and dental health services are provided 2 days a week. It was stated that an appointment system was introduced with the Pandemic. Health personnel stated that the medical equipment in the Center is sufficient for emergency intervention and examination and that there are imaging devices in the Center. According to the information received from the Empowered Migrant Health Center, the average daily number of people benefiting from health services varies according to the type of service. On a daily average, 340 people benefit from outpatient clinic services, 25 people benefit from routine vaccination services, 15 people benefit from pregnancy follow-up services, and 10 people benefit from psychosocial services.
26. It was stated that informative activities on cleaning issues were carried out in the Center during the Pandemic period. It was stated that vaccination activities are ongoing, and as of the day of the visit, 4,058 people received the first dose, 267 people received the second dose and 1 person received the third dose of vaccine. It was stated that vaccination activities against Covid-19 continued rapidly and it was said that an average of 50 people were vaccinated against Covid-19 per day. Personnel working at the Center were observed to pay attention to mask and distance rules in general.



27. A total of 9 physicians (6 general practitioners, 2 pediatricians, and 1 gynecologist) and 12 nurses work at the Center. It was stated that when psychiatry and other specialties are

required, patients are referred to other hospitals. Besides doctors and nurses, there are 2 social service workers, 1 laboratory technician, 3 pharmacy technicians, and 5 servant in the Empowered Migrant Health Center.

28. The interviewed health personnel stated that the persons under protection in the Center have psychological problems due to their insufficient social well-being in their current lives, being victims of war, not having a settled life, and the economic difficulties they are experiencing; therefore, there is a need for a psychologist in the Health Center.
29. Within the scope of the SIHHAT Project (Project for Improving the Health Status of Syrians under Temporary Protection and Related Services Provided by the Republic of Türkiye), Syrian health workers also work at the Center.
30. The Center provides ambulance service for 5 days on weekdays. It is learned that ambulance services can be provided partially on weekends and evenings due to the pandemic, and in cases of severe illness and emergencies, 112 Emergency Call Center is used and the ambulance reaches the Center in a short time.

Both the staff working at the Empowered Migrant Health Center and the people receiving services have stated that since the establishment of the Center, there has been no problem such as late intervention to a patient who needs urgent intervention.

31. As preventive health services, it was stated that routine vaccinations were carried out, heel prick blood was taken and followed up, health and hygiene training were provided, and Covid-19 information seminars were provided by the Empowered Migrant Health Center. In addition, it was stated that as soon as any symptoms of an outbreak are detected by health units, the Public Health Communicable Diseases Unit is notified and intervened before the outbreak grows. It was stated that the families under protection at the Center were hesitant about childhood vaccinations that are routinely administered from birth, those who refused these vaccinations were informed by the social service workers, and in case of refusal to be vaccinated, petitions were taken from these families. It was also reported that the Empowered Migrant Health Center conducts pregnancy follow-ups once a month.



32. There had been no outbreak of any epidemic disease in the Center until the date of the visit. However, it was reported that all children between the ages of 1 and 15 were vaccinated in May 2018 due to the emergence of a person infected with MMR (Measles-Mumps-Rubella) disease.
33. People under protection at the Center were asked whether they were satisfied with the health services and they said that the doctors and other staff were very attentive and that some patients were followed up by visiting the containers when necessary. The staff also reported that people who could not come to the Empowered Migrant Health Center were treated and followed up at home.
34. Patients can obtain medicines prescribed by doctors from pharmacies outside the Center or through the medicine supply unit established at the Center. In this unit, the prescriptions of the patients are forwarded to the pharmacy and are delivered to the patients on the same day. Medicines are provided for persons with temporary protection status. It has been stated that Iraqis under protection in the Center have to buy medicines for a fee since they do not have temporary protection status and that these people have difficulties in obtaining medicines since they do not have any income.

### 3.4. Psychosocial Support Services

35. There is a Social Services Unit under the Provincial Directorate of Family and Social Services in the Center. We have been informed that 1 child development counselor and 1 interpreter work in the Social Services Unit. It was reported that the Red Crescent also

provided psychiatrist and psychologist support once as part of a practice launched in August 2020.

36. The Social Services Unit conducts interviews with those under protection at the Center and tries to find solutions to their problems within the framework of the psychosocial support program. Unit personnel stated that they go to the containers where disabled people are located, fill in a pre-prepared form to determine their needs, and make work planning accordingly. It was stated that training activities were also carried out in the said Unit, but these activities were suspended for a while due to the pandemic situation, training activities were restarted about two weeks before the date of the visit, and training was planned for the needs of those under protection at the Center. It is stated that the training is given in the conference hall with a capacity of 200 people in the Center.
37. There is a playground for children in the Social Service Unit. There is also an interview room where the relevant personnel can privately interview persons under protection who apply to this Unit.
38. It was stated that the Provincial Directorate of Social Services provides personnel for the children who are under protection at the Center and for whom counseling cautionary decisions have been taken. In the interviews with individuals, it was stated that the Center mainly works on traumatic syndromes experienced after the war. It was learned that teachers are providing special education for severely disabled children. During the visit, it was observed that education was continuing and teachers were taking care of students with disabilities.
39. It was stated by the staff that there were approximately 40 people who were victims of domestic violence and necessary actions were taken regarding the cases. It was stated that family interviews were held for individuals with mental illness at the Center, the process was carried out together with the family, and it was learned that two people with severe mental illness were taken under protection and placed in institutional care. Moreover, two elderly individuals who were taken under protection at the Center were placed in a nursing home. It was stated that the Social Services Unit at the Center provides all services except financial support.

### **3.5. Social Benefits**

40. “Kızılay Kart” is given to every individual who is in the temporary protection status and TRY 125 is deposited to those cards monthly per person.<sup>3</sup> There isn’t any age limit for obtaining the card.
41. There is also a market that has branches in many points throughout Türkiye. Prices in there are same with the other branches, and it was seen that various can meals and some local bread preferred by the Syrian people are sold in the market too. Kızılay Kart can be used in this market. However, during the visits to the containers, it was stated by the persons under protection that the money deposited in the Kızılay Kart was not enough to buy even basic food if there was no one working in the family and that one person could not survive for a month with 125 liras.

### **3.6. Education**

42. There are 4 schools and 96 classrooms in the Center.
43. Primary and secondary education is compulsory and high school is optional in the Center. The total number of children attending school is 4.069. Among the children under protection in the Center, 240 are attending kindergarten, 1,437 are attending primary school, 1,634 are attending secondary school, 632 are attending high school and 126 are attending vocational or Imam Hatip high school. The average class size in schools is around 25-30 students.
44. The Center employs permanent teachers assigned by the Ministry of National Education and Syrian teachers within the scope of the Project on Promoting Integration of Syrian Kids into the Turkish Education System (PICLES). According to the table shared by the administration, the Education Services Unit employs 242 permanent staff and a total of 450 people, including temporary assignments. The majority of the teachers are Turkish teachers. At the time of the visit, 9 Syrian teachers were working in schools.
45. The school administration informed us that there were 49 morning and afternoon classes in the primary school. We were informed that PICLES was started to be implemented in primary and secondary schools in 2012, and within the scope of this Project, lessons were taught in Turkish and Arabic languages between 2012 and 2016, and that the

---

<sup>3</sup>Kızılay Kart is a smart card system that is produced to help people to buy what they want rather than what they are given.

implementation of the Project ended in 2016 for primary and secondary schools, after which the curriculum of the Ministry of National Education was implemented.

46. The Center has a special education class for children with mental and physical disabilities at the primary school level. Education continues with two teachers. During the visit, it was observed that a disabled child was being educated in the special education class. It was stated by the teachers that the necessary materials for the education of a disabled child were available in the classroom. It was learned that special attention was paid to children with disabilities and that teachers took turns bringing children with disabilities to the classroom. It was found out that 27 children are enrolled in special education classes at the Center and 8 of them have moderate and severe disabilities.
47. The Center has 1 child-friendly area and 1 youth-friendly area. However, the youth-friendly area was not active at the time of the visit. The administrative functioning of both areas is entrusted to the Red Crescent. According to the information received from the Administration, children between the ages of 4-9, 10-13, and 14-17 benefit from the child-friendly area. It is stated that almost all children in the specified age group benefit from this area. Psychosocial activities, adaptation activities, "My Teacher Project" are organized here and trainings are provided on topics such as child protection training, volunteering training and leadership training. Apart from these areas, there are 8 children's playgrounds.
48. Other activities carried out for children are listed by the Administration as follows: Social cohesion, excursions, and sportive activities by the Provincial Directorate of Migration Management; Qur'an courses by the Religious Services Unit; course services by the Provincial Directorate of Youth and Sports; youth and children activities by the Red Crescent; and various courses and activities by the Directorate of National Education and Public Education Center. It was also stated that non-governmental organizations also carried out various events and activities.
49. It was observed that public education centers continued to serve during the pandemic period. However, the administrators stated that educational activities ceased during the period when schools were closed and students could not access the Education Information Network (EBA).

### **3.7. Activities and Courses**

50. The Center offers Turkish literacy courses, art, sports, and vocational courses within the Public Education Center. Turkish literacy courses are divided into A1, A2, B1, B2 according to the level of the person. Art courses include painting, theatre, music and folk

dances. Table tennis, wrestling, swimming, basketball, and taekwondo courses have been opened as part of the sports program. It was observed by the visiting delegation that there are also vocational training courses such as needlework, carpet weaving, sewing, embroidery and hairdressing and that the trainees are actively attending these courses. The total number of trainers in the courses is 23.



51. According to the information shared by the Central Administration, a total of 34 courses were opened, including 4 courses in Turkish literacy, 10 courses in art, 4 courses in sports, 11 courses for vocational training, and 5 other courses. Considering the utilization of the courses, it is seen that women prefer to participate in the courses more. Whereas the total number of women participating in the courses is 385, the number of men is only 80. During the interview with the Public Education Center personnel, it was learned that the majority of the 80 men who participated in the courses were children.

52. Public Education Center personnel stated that schools were closed during the pandemic period, but that courses were open in general, except for some courses, and that even during the visit, there were open courses. The open course workshops were also visited by the visiting delegation. It was learned that in the sewing and embroidery course, school uniforms are sewn here, some women earn money by selling the clothes they make here, and women generally prefer the course in question to sew clothes for themselves and their family members. During the interview with the trainer, it was learned that there was a shortage of materials and that the materials required for the course were sent upon request, but they were not enough. The trainer stated that there is a serious potential for production in the Center and that women can produce much more beautiful and numerous items with

better materials. The trainer further stated that he/she observed that the mental health of the women who started and continued the course was positively affected.



53. During the visit to the painting workshop, the trainer was interviewed and it was learned that a painting exhibition was opened. The remaining paintings from the painting exhibition are exhibited in a corner in the Public Education Center.
54. In the theatre course, it was stated that no play was being performed at the time of the visit, but a play had been performed in the conference hall of the Center.

### **3.8. Contact with the Outside World, Visiting and Interaction with Families**

55. Those under protection at the Center have the right to enter and exit the Center between 05:00 a.m. and 9:00 p.m. and once a day. However, in special cases, these periods and numbers may be increased by the discretion of the administration.
56. The persons under protection in the Center must comply with the rules such as leaving their belongings to the x-ray device at the entrance and exit gates, having their identity cards read, and being searched with a detector. These rules are printed in Turkish and Arabic by the Administration and given to the persons who will be staying at the Center when they first arrive. A list of these rules was requested from the Center Administration. Under the aforementioned rules; the persons under protection at the Center are entitled to leave for a maximum of 15 days within 6 months and the extension of this period is only possible with the approval of the Administration in case of force majeure. If the persons spend a maximum of 3 days outside the Center, they are dismissed from the Center.

58. It is stated that persons who do not enter the Center in an orderly manner shall be immediately notified to the Center Administration by their families, otherwise various sanctions shall be imposed by the Administration, including the termination of their relationship with the Center. It was stated by the Center Administration that although the rules are strict, strict sanctions are not imposed as the discretion is wide.
59. The visitor meetings at the Center are held in the visiting room with permission and no visitors are allowed to enter the Center otherwise. While visiting was held in the visitor rooms during the working hours, visits were suspended with the recommendation of the Provincial Directorate of Health during the pandemic process. It has been stated that before the pandemic there were no time restrictions on visits unless it was very busy. It was reported that relatives were contacted by telephone during the pandemic period.

### **3.9. Vulnerable Groups**

60. Vulnerable groups, also defined as disadvantaged, delicate or groups with special needs, generally include people who are in a weaker position compared to other people in society, who need protection and support, and who have difficulty participating in different areas of life such as employment, education, health, politics, who are excluded from society due to their disadvantaged position and who are at risk of discrimination. People displaced by wars, civil conflicts, or political repression may also constitute a vulnerable group in the countries where they go. All individuals under protection at the Center are included in the vulnerable group in this context. However, a vulnerable group may also include individuals who are in a more disadvantaged position. Therefore, the Center hosts disabled individuals, mentally and physically disabled children, elderly individuals, and individuals who have been subjected to domestic violence.
61. There are a total of 318 persons with disability health board reports in the Center. Accordingly, it was learned that some people had more than one disability. The Center Administration stated that disabled people were placed in areas and containers where they could not be victimized. Severely physically disabled individuals were placed in a container close to the hospital. It was indicated that individuals who are unable to do their work and who do not have a companion are provided with companion support. Moreover, it was stated that weekly and monthly follow-ups of disabled individuals were carried out regularly.
62. The Administration indicated that when disabled persons request an interview, they are contacted without delay. It was also stated that persons with disabilities benefited from the assistance received at the Center in a prioritized and positive manner. Although the

administration states that it has taken the necessary measures, it has been observed that there are no accessibility measures for disabled people to move comfortably within the Center. For example, there are no audible warning signs, embossed road signs for visually impaired individuals, and ramps in some of the places with high entrances.

63. 306 women are living separately from their husbands for any reason and 377 orphans are living in the Center. It was learned they were placed in the same containers upon the women's request. It was stated that there are no children without company in the Center and that other relatives are responsible for the care and supervision of children without parents. It is stated that there are 40 cases of domestic violence in the Center and the Psychosocial Support Services have regular meetings with these persons and follow-ups are carried out. It is reported that family meetings are held for individuals with mental illness in the Center, the process is carried out together with the family, and it is learned that two individuals with severe mental illness were taken under protection and placed in institutional care. Moreover, two elderly individuals who were taken under protection at the Center were placed in a nursing home.

### 3.10. Personnel

64. The administration of the Center consists of three deputy administrators, two provincial migration experts, and one gendarmerie sergeant, under the supervision of the Deputy Governor. A total of 12 personnel, 1 of whom is a woman, work in the Reception, Placement, and Evacuation Procedures Unit at the Center. The Logistics and Distribution Services Unit has 14 personnel, 1 of whom is a woman. Technical Services Unit employs 34 people, and there are no female employees in this unit. The Cleaning and Environmental Health Services Unit employs 15 personnel, 1 of whom is a woman.



65. There are 6 interpreters at the Center. Although an obstetrician works at the Center and pregnancy follow-up is carried out, there is no female interpreter.
66. It was stated that occupational health and safety training was given to all personnel working at the Center and that the training was ongoing as of the day of the visit. It was reported that all staff had received online human rights training provided by the Ministry of Interior and that this training was continuing at that time. External security of the Center is ensured by the gendarmerie and internal security is ensured by security personnel. A total of 160 security personnel, 22 of whom are women, work in the Private Security Services Unit at the Center. Some of the security guards patrol the Center and some of them keep watch in the security towers.
67. There is a Fire Brigade Service Unit at the Center in terms of fire safety. The unit has 2 fire trucks allocated by Kahramanmaraş Metropolitan Municipality and 9 personnel. The fire brigade provides service on a 24/7 basis. It was reported that a total of 13 containers had caught fire until the date of the visit, but no loss of life was reported owing to the rapid response to the fires.



## **4. EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

### **4.1. EVALUATION**

68. During the interviews, individuals under protection at the Center expressed their satisfaction at every opportunity. The good material conditions of the Center, the availability of work opportunities, arrangements and home care services for the disabled, workshops in different fields, the opening of a special education class for mentally and physically disabled children, the election of representatives for each neighborhood by the persons under protection at the Center, the special care and follow-up of victims of domestic violence, and the self-sacrificing efforts of the Center Administration and staff were evaluated as examples of good practices. During the interviews with the persons under protection at the

Center, the efforts of the Center Administration and the staff were appreciated for the absence of any complaints and the expression of satisfaction at every opportunity, the availability of social facilities at the Center, the sensitivity shown by the Center Administration towards vulnerable groups and the measures taken.

## **4.2. RECOMMENDATIONS**

### **4.2.1. Recommendations to the Center**

69. The right to life is under protection by both international and regional regulations and national legislation and states have positive obligations to protect the right to life of persons under protection. It has been informed that fire broke out in 13 containers at the Center. However, despite the fires, people under protection at the Center still covered the containers with blankets, sheets, etc. in a way to create a risk of fire and to increase the damage in case of a fire. For this reason, it is considered that it is important to regularly repeat the warnings made to the individuals on the subject, and it is considered that making the necessary insulation to make the container interiors cooler in summer will reduce the possible fire risks and minimize the damage in case of a fire.
70. Article 28 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child guarantees the child's right to education. As per the article; *"Every child shall be encouraged and protected to receive a full education. Primary education shall be compulsory and available free to all children without any discrimination whatsoever."* Although the number of schools in the Center is sufficient for children and the schooling rate (around seventy-five percent for children under the age of 18) is high, we have learned that education was not provided in schools during the Covid-19 pandemic, and students could not access remote education systems such as EBA due to technological and technical impossibilities and were deprived of their right to education. Therefore, it is considered that necessary initiatives should be taken to provide internet and necessary devices free of charge to the extent possible for children to access education at the Center.
71. The article 31 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child states that *"States Parties recognize the right of the child to rest and leisure, to engage in play and recreational activities appropriate to the age of the child and to participate freely in cultural life and the arts."* In this scope, establishing a green area in the school garden, allocated for students to spend time in and out of classes and between classes, and considering the climatic conditions, constructing covered benches and a playground where children can rest,

especially in the summer period, will provide a suitable environment for children to leisure and spend their free time.

72. Accessibility practices aimed at eliminating the disadvantageous conditions of disabled individuals are important. Containers, which are living spaces, should be specially designed according to the needs of disabled individuals, ramps should be built to make it easier to enter and exit the containers with wheelchairs, and necessary road signs should be placed for visually impaired individuals. In order for disabled people to increase their participation in social activities, a disabled-friendly park where various activities can be provided can be established within the Center.

#### **4.2.2. Recommendations to Presidency of Migration Management**

73. Although it was stated that the personnel at the center receive general training on human rights, no specific training is provided about vulnerable groups, refugee rights, and the examination and documentation of allegations of torture and ill-treatment. Article 18 of the Directive on the Establishment, Management and Operation of Temporary Accommodation Centers states that *"In-service training on communication, stress management, cultural sensitivity and the rights and obligations of those under temporary protection may be provided to personnel working in temporary Accommodation centers."* In this context, it is considered that the preparation of a training program for staff based on a rights-based approach can contribute to the protection and promotion of fundamental rights and freedoms.
74. The right to food also constitutes a guarantee of the right to life. One of the most common complaints of those under protection at the Center is that the 125 liras deposited on the Kızılay Kart is not enough to meet their basic food needs. Accordingly, it was assessed that people in need should be provided with basic food at regular intervals or the amount deposited on the Kızılay Kart should be revised in line with the current economic conditions.
75. Although 5,145 of those taken under protection at the Center are women, there are no female employees among the interpreters. It can be concluded that female interpreters should be employed to ensure privacy and overcome possible hesitations regarding communication.

#### **4.2.3. Recommendation to the Ministry of National Education**

76. According to Article 30 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child; *"In those States in which ethnic, religious or linguistic minorities or persons of indigenous origin exist, a child belonging to such a minority or who is indigenous shall not be denied the right, in*

*community with other members of his or her group, to enjoy his or her own culture, to profess and practice his or her own religion, or to use his or her own language.*"<sup>4</sup> In line with this arrangement, PICTES courses were taught in Turkish and Arabic languages, but this practice was discontinued in 2016 and the courses were taught only in Turkish and according to the curriculum of the Ministry of National Education. However, it has been suggested that children should learn to read and write in their mother tongue and take lessons introducing their own culture, and in this context, some additions can be made to the curriculum.

#### **4.2.4. Recommendation to the Ministry of Health**

77. The Center provides protection to persons from different countries. During the visit, we learned that persons from Iraq who are under protection but who are not granted temporary protection status do not have free access to medication. Lack of access to medication may prevent people from regaining their health and may cause undesirable consequences in severe diseases. For this reason, it should be ensured that people staying in the Center benefit from health services equally regardless of their status.

---

<sup>4</sup> The Republic of Türkiye has made a reservation to Article 30 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child.